

# Connected, Bounded Degree, Triangle Avoidance Games

Nishali Mehta\*

The Ohio State University  
nishali@math.ohio-state.edu

Ákos Seress\*

The Ohio State University  
Centre for Mathematics of Symmetry and Computation  
University of Western Australia  
akos@math.ohio-state.edu

Submitted: May 31, 2010; Accepted: Sept 6, 2011; Published: Sep 26, 2011  
Mathematics Subject Classification: 05C57

## Abstract

We consider variants of the triangle-avoidance game first defined by Harary and rediscovered by Hajnal a few years later. A graph game begins with two players and an empty graph on  $n$  vertices. The two players take turns choosing edges within  $K_n$ , building up a simple graph. The edges must be chosen according to a set of restrictions  $\mathcal{R}$ . The winner is the last player to choose an edge that does not violate any of the restrictions in  $\mathcal{R}$ . For fixed  $n$  and  $\mathcal{R}$ , one of the players has a winning strategy. For a pair of games where  $\mathcal{R}$  includes bounded degree, connectedness, and triangle-avoidance, we determine the winner for all values of  $n$ .

## 1 Introduction

Two players,  $\mathcal{A}$  and  $\mathcal{B}$ , begin with an empty graph on  $n$  vertices, where  $n \geq 3$ . Player  $\mathcal{A}$  goes first, choosing an edge between two vertices. The two players take turns choosing edges within  $K_n$ , building up a simple graph. The edges have to be chosen according to a set of restrictions  $\mathcal{R}$ . The winner is the last player to choose an edge that does not violate any of the restrictions in  $\mathcal{R}$ . For fixed  $n$  and  $\mathcal{R}$ , one of the players has a winning strategy. Let  $\Gamma_{\mathcal{R}}(n)$  represent the game with restriction set  $\mathcal{R}$  on  $n$  vertices. Let  $f_{\mathcal{R}} : \mathbb{N} \setminus \{1, 2\} \rightarrow \{\mathcal{A}, \mathcal{B}\}$  be the function defined by

---

\*Research partially supported by the NSF and by ARC Grant DP1096525.

$$f_{\mathcal{R}}(n) = \text{winner of } \Gamma_{\mathcal{R}}(n).$$

We will look at games with one or more of the following restrictions and determine the winner for all values of  $n$ .

Let  $G(V, E) \leq K_n$  be the graph made up of all edges chosen so far in the game. Let  $u, v \in V, u \neq v, (u, v) \notin E$ .

**Restriction B2** (Bounded Degree). *If  $\max\{\deg_G(u), \deg_G(v)\} \geq 2$ , then the edge  $(u, v)$  cannot be chosen.*

**Restriction B3** (Bounded Degree). *If  $\max\{\deg_G(u), \deg_G(v)\} \geq 3$ , then the edge  $(u, v)$  cannot be chosen.*

**Restriction T** (Triangle Avoidance). *If  $\exists w \in V \setminus \{u, v\}$  such that both edges  $(u, w), (v, w) \in E$ , then the edge  $(u, v)$  cannot be chosen.*

Let  $M$  be the upper bound on the vertex degree, e.g.  $M = 3$  if  $\mathcal{R}$  includes Restriction B3. When no upper bound is specified,  $M = n - 1$ .

**Restriction C** (Connectedness). *If  $\deg_G(u) = 0, \deg_G(v) = 0$  and there is  $w \in V$  such that  $0 < \deg_G(w) < M$ , then the edge  $(u, v)$  cannot be chosen.*

In this paper we prove the following two theorems:

**Theorem 4.5.** *For  $n \geq 5, f_{\{B3, C\}}(n) = \mathcal{B} \iff n \equiv 2 \pmod{4}$ .*

**Theorem 5.6.** *For  $n \geq 12, f_{\{B3, T, C\}}(n) = \mathcal{B} \iff n \equiv 1, 2 \pmod{4}$ .*

The games with  $\mathcal{R} = \{B2, C\}$  and  $\mathcal{R} = \{B2, T, C\}$  are relatively simple. As a result, it is not too difficult to show the following.

**Proposition.** *For  $n \geq 4, f_{\{B2, C\}}(n) = \mathcal{A} \iff n \equiv 0 \pmod{2}$ . For  $n \geq 3, f_{\{B2, T, C\}}(n) = \mathcal{A} \iff n \equiv 2 \pmod{4}$ .*

In an accompanying paper [5], we give a complete analysis of the four games with  $\mathcal{R} \subset \{B2, B3, T\}$  and  $|\mathcal{R} \cap \{B2, B3\}| = 1$ .

## 2 Background

The triangle avoidance game  $\Gamma_{\{T\}}(n)$ , suggested by Frank Harary [3] and six years later by András Hajnal, remains open in the general case. The function  $f_{\{T\}}(n)$  is known for values of  $n \leq 15$ . The winners for  $n \leq 12$  were computed by Cater, Harary, and Robinson [1]. Pralat [6] computed the winners for  $n = 13, 14, 15$ . Gordinowicz and Pralat [2] computed the winner for  $n = 16$ .

$n$	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16
$f_{\{T\}}(n)$	$\mathcal{B}$	$\mathcal{B}$	$\mathcal{B}$	$\mathcal{A}$	$\mathcal{B}$	$\mathcal{B}$	$\mathcal{B}$	$\mathcal{A}$	$\mathcal{B}$	$\mathcal{A}$	$\mathcal{A}$	$\mathcal{A}$	$\mathcal{A}$	$\mathcal{A}$

The connected version of the triangle avoidance game,  $\Gamma_{\{T,C\}}(n)$ , was solved by Seress [7]. He proved  $f_{\{T,C\}}(n) = \mathcal{A} \iff n \equiv 0 \pmod{2}$ .

This paper and the accompanying paper by Mehta and Seress [5], are based on the thesis work by Mehta [4].

### 3 Definitions

When  $|V| = n$ , write  $V = \{v_1, \dots, v_n\}$ . Let  $e_i$  denote the  $i$ th edge chosen and  $E_k = \{e_1, \dots, e_k\}$ . For given  $n$  and  $k$ , let  $G_{n,k}$  be the graph on vertex set  $V$  with edge set  $E_k$ . The graphs  $G = G_{n,k}$  we consider will always satisfy  $\deg_G(v) \leq 3$  for all vertices  $v \in V$ .

We make the following convention, simplifying the description of the games. The ordering of  $V$  defines a natural lexicographic ordering  $<$  of the edges of the complete graph  $K_n$ . Given a graph  $G_{n,k}$ , if the next player chooses the edge  $e_{k+1}$  then there is no edge  $e < e_{k+1}$  such that  $G_{n,k+1} \simeq G_{n,k} \cup e$ .

A vertex  $v_i$  is said to be *out of play* if,  $\forall v_j \in V \setminus \{v_i\}$  such that  $(v_i, v_j) \notin E$ , choosing the edge  $(v_i, v_j)$  will violate a restriction in  $\mathcal{R}$ . A vertex  $v_i$  that is not out of play is *in play*. In each game mentioned here, once a vertex is out of play it remains out of play for the rest of the game.

We make a second convention, further simplifying the description. Given a graph  $G_{n,k}$ , if the next player chooses the edge  $e_{k+1}$  then there is no edge  $e < e_{k+1}$  such that game play for the remainder of the game is identical in  $G_{n,k+1}$  and  $G_{n,k} \cup e$ . (This situation can occur if the induced subgraphs on the vertices still in play are isomorphic, even if the graphs themselves are not.)

The choice of the  $k$ th edge  $e_k$  will be called the *kth round*.

Define sets  $Z, P, T \subset V$  on a graph  $G$  according to vertex degree:

$$\begin{aligned} Z(G) &= \{v \in V(G) : \deg_G(v) = 0\}, & z(G) &= |Z(G)| \\ P(G) &= \{v \in V(G) : \deg_G(v) = 1\}, & p(G) &= |P(G)| \\ T(G) &= \{v \in V(G) : \deg_G(v) = 2\}, & t(G) &= |T(G)|. \end{aligned}$$

### 4 $\mathcal{R} = \{B3, C\}$

In the game  $\Gamma_{\{B3,C\}}(n)$ , we define graph classes  $\mathcal{K}_i(z)$  for  $i=1,2,3,4$ , where  $z \geq 0$  is an integer. One player can maintain that, for particular values of  $k$ , the graph  $G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{K}_i(z)$  for some  $i$ . That is, this player does not stay within  $\mathcal{K}_i(z)$  after each of his turns, but regularly returns to it after a few rounds. Following this strategy until the end of the game forces a win.

Define sets of graphs  $\mathcal{K}_i(z)$  for  $i=1,2,3,4$  as follows:

1. For any integer  $z \geq 0$ ,  $G(V, E) \in \mathcal{K}_1(z) \iff z(G) = z, p(G) = 0$ , and  $t(G) = 2$ , with  $T(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$ ,  $(u_1, u_2) \in E$ .
2. For any integer  $z \geq 0$ ,  $G(V, E) \in \mathcal{K}_2(z) \iff z(G) = z, p(G) = 0$ , and  $t(G) = 1$ .

3. For any integer  $z \geq 0$ ,  $G(V, E) \in \mathcal{K}_3(z) \iff z(G) = z, p(G) = 1$ , and  $t(G) = 0$ .
4. For any integer  $z \geq 0$ ,  $G(V, E) \in \mathcal{K}_4(z) \iff z(G) = z, p(G) = 1$ , and  $t(G) = 1$ , with  $u_1 \in P(G)$ ,  $u_2 \in T(G)$ ,  $(u_1, u_2) \in E$ .

**Lemma 4.1.** *For  $n \geq 3$ , in  $\Gamma_{\{B_3, C\}}(n)$  if either player chooses an edge that creates a graph in  $\mathcal{K}_1(z)$  with  $z \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$  then that player has a winning strategy.*

*Proof.* Let  $n \geq 3$ . Suppose the edges  $e_1, \dots, e_{k-1}$  have already been chosen. Suppose player  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the  $k$ th edge so that  $G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{K}_1(z)$  with  $z \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ . Then  $T(G_{n,k}) = \{u_1, u_2\}$  with  $(u_1, u_2) \in E_k$ . The strategy described here will work for  $\mathcal{B}$  as well. We proceed by induction on  $z$ .

Base case:  $z = 0$ . All vertices are out of play except  $u_1$  and  $u_2$ , which are already connected by an edge. Since no new edge can be chosen,  $\mathcal{A}$  wins.

Assume for induction that the statement holds when  $z = 4m$  for some  $m \geq 0$ . Suppose  $z = 4(m+1)$ . Let  $Z(G_{n,k}) = \{w_1, \dots, w_{4m+4}\}$ . Each vertex  $v \notin (Z(G_{n,k}) \cup T(G_{n,k}))$  has  $\deg_{G_{n,k}}(v) = 3$  and is out of play.

Up to game play equivalence,  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(u_1, w_1)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(u_2, w_1)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(w_1, w_2)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_2, w_3)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(w_2, w_4)$  or  $(w_3, w_4)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. Now vertices  $u_1, u_2, w_1, w_2$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+6}) = 4m$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+6}) = 0$ , and  $t(G_{n,k+6}) = 2$  with  $T(G_{n,k+6}) = \{w_3, w_4\}$ ,  $(w_3, w_4) \in E_{k+6}$ . Thus  $G_{n,k+6} \in \mathcal{K}_1(4m)$ , so  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by induction.  $\square$

**Lemma 4.2.** *For  $n \geq 3$ , in  $\Gamma_{\{B_3, C\}}(n)$  if either player chooses an edge that creates a graph in  $\mathcal{K}_2(z)$  with  $z \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$  then that player has a winning strategy.*

*Proof.* Let  $n \geq 3$ . Suppose the edges  $e_1, \dots, e_{k-1}$  have already been chosen. Suppose player  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the  $k$ th edge so that  $G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{K}_2(z)$  with  $z \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ . The strategy described here will work for  $\mathcal{B}$  as well. We proceed by induction on  $z$ .

Base case:  $z = 0$ . All but one vertex are out of play, so no new edge can be chosen. Thus  $\mathcal{A}$  wins.

Assume for induction that the statement holds when  $z = 4m$  for some  $m \geq 0$ . Suppose  $z = 4(m+1)$ . Let  $Z(G_{n,k}) = \{w_1, \dots, w_{4m+4}\}$ . Let  $T(G_{n,k}) = \{u\}$ . Each vertex  $v \notin (Z(G_{n,k}) \cup T(G_{n,k}))$  has  $\deg_{G_{n,k}}(v) = 3$  and is out of play.

Up to isomorphism,  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(u, w_1)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_1, w_2)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(w_1, w_3)$  or  $(w_2, w_3)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not.  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(w_2, w_4)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_3, w_4)$ . Now vertices  $u, w_1, w_2, w_3$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+6}) = 4m$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+6}) = 0$ , and  $t(G_{n,k+6}) = 1$ . Thus  $G_{n,k+6} \in \mathcal{K}_2(4m)$ , so  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by induction.  $\square$

**Lemma 4.3.** *For  $n \geq 3$ , in  $\Gamma_{\{B_3, C\}}(n)$  if either player chooses an edge that creates a graph in  $\mathcal{K}_3(z)$  with  $z \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$  then that player has a winning strategy.*

*Proof.* Let  $n \geq 3$ . Suppose the edges  $e_1, \dots, e_{k-1}$  have already been chosen. Suppose player  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the  $k$ th edge so that  $G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{K}_3(z)$  with  $z \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ . The strategy described here will work for  $\mathcal{B}$  as well. We proceed by induction.

Base case:  $z = 0$ . All but one vertex are out of play, so no new edge can be chosen. Thus  $\mathcal{A}$  wins.

Assume for induction that the statement holds when  $z = 4m$  for some  $m \geq 0$ . Suppose  $z = 4(m + 1)$ . Let  $Z(G_{n,k}) = \{w_1, \dots, w_{4m+4}\}$ . Let  $P(G_{n,k}) = \{u\}$ . Each vertex  $v \notin (Z(G_{n,k}) \cup P(G_{n,k}))$  has  $\deg_{G_{n,k}}(v) = 3$  and is out of play.

Up to isomorphism,  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(u, w_1)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(u, w_2)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(w_1, w_3)$  or  $(w_1, w_2)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not.  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(w_2, w_3)$ ,  $(w_2, w_4)$ , or  $(w_3, w_4)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(w_2, w_3)$  then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_3, w_4)$ . Now vertices  $u, w_1, w_2, w_3$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+6}) = 4m$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+6}) = 1$ , and  $t(G_{n,k+6}) = 0$ . Thus  $G_{n,k+6} \in \mathcal{K}_3(4m)$ , so  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by induction.
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(w_2, w_4)$  or  $(w_3, w_4)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. Now vertices  $u, w_1, w_2$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+6}) = 4m$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+6}) = 0$ , and  $t(G_{n,k+6}) = 2$  with  $T(G_{n,k+6}) = \{w_3, w_4\}$ ,  $(w_3, w_4) \in E_{k+6}$ . Thus  $G_{n,k+6} \in \mathcal{K}_1(4m)$ , so  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by Lemma 4.1.

□

**Lemma 4.4.** *For  $n \geq 3$ , in  $\Gamma_{\{B3,C\}}(n)$  if either player chooses an edge that creates a graph in  $\mathcal{K}_4(z)$  with  $z \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$  then that player has a winning strategy.*

*Proof.* Let  $n \geq 3$ . Suppose the edges  $e_1, \dots, e_{k-1}$  have already been chosen. Suppose player  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the  $k$ th edge so that  $G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{K}_4(z)$  with  $z \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ . Then  $P(G_{n,k}) = \{u_1\}$  and  $T(G_{n,k}) = \{u_2\}$ , with  $(u_1, u_2) \in E_k$ . The strategy described here will work for  $\mathcal{B}$  as well. We proceed by induction.

Base case:  $z = 0$ . All vertices are out of play except  $u_1$  and  $u_2$ , which are already connected by an edge. Since no new edge can be chosen,  $\mathcal{A}$  wins.

Assume for induction that the statement holds when  $z = 4m$  for some  $m \geq 0$ . Suppose  $z = 4(m + 1)$ . Let  $Z(G_{n,k}) = \{w_1, \dots, w_{4m+4}\}$ . Each vertex  $v \notin (Z(G_{n,k}) \cup P(G_{n,k}) \cup T(G_{n,k}))$  has  $\deg_{G_{n,k}}(v) = 3$  and is out of play.

Up to isomorphism,  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(u_1, w_1)$  or  $(u_2, w_1)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not.  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(u_1, w_2)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_1, w_2)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(w_2, w_3)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_3, w_4)$ . Now vertices  $u_1, u_2, w_1, w_2$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+6}) = 4m$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+6}) = 1$ , and  $t(G_{n,k+6}) = 1$  with  $P(G_{n,k+6}) = \{w_4\}$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+6}) = \{w_3\}$ ,  $(w_3, w_4) \in E_{k+6}$ . Thus  $G_{n,k+6} \in \mathcal{K}_4(4m)$ , so  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by induction. □

**Theorem 4.5.** *For  $n \geq 5$ ,  $f_{\{B3,C\}}(n) = \mathcal{B} \iff n \equiv 2 \pmod{4}$ .*

*Proof.* For small values of  $n$ , an exhaustive case analysis can be carried out by hand calculation.

$n$	3	4	5	6	7	8
$f_{\{B3,C\}}(n)$	$\mathcal{A}$	$\mathcal{B}$	$\mathcal{A}$	$\mathcal{B}$	$\mathcal{A}$	$\mathcal{A}$

**$n \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ :**

We proceed by induction on  $n$ .

Base case:  $n = 8$ . This was solved by hand calculation.

Assume for induction that  $f_{\{B3,C\}}(n) = \mathcal{A}$  when  $n = 4m$  for some  $m \geq 2$ . Suppose  $n = 4m + 4$ .  $V = \{v_1, \dots, v_{4m+4}\}$ .

$\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_1, v_2)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(v_1, v_3)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_3)$  to make a triangle.  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(v_1, v_4)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_4)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_3, v_4)$  or  $(v_3, v_5)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_4)$ , then vertices  $v_1, v_2, v_3, v_4$  are out of play. The remaining vertices  $v_5, \dots, v_{4m+4}$  have degree zero and it is  $\mathcal{A}$ 's turn. Play continues as in  $\Gamma_{B3,C}(4m)$ , so  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by induction.
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_5)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_5)$ . Now vertices  $v_1, v_2, v_3, v_4$  are out of play.  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(v_5, v_6)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_7)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_6, v_8)$  or  $(v_7, v_8)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. Now  $v_5, v_6$  are also out of play.  $z(G_{4m+4,11}) = 4m - 4$ ,  $p(G_{4m+4,11}) = 0$ , and  $t(G_{4m+4,11}) = 2$  with  $T(G_{4m+4,11}) = \{v_7, v_8\}$ ,  $(v_7, v_8) \in E_{11}$ . Thus  $G_{4m+4,11} \in \mathcal{K}_1(4m - 4)$ , so  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by Lemma 4.1.

**$n \equiv 1 \pmod{4}$ :**

We proceed by induction on  $n$ .

Base case:  $n = 5$ . This was solved by hand calculation.

Assume for induction that  $f_{\{B3,C\}}(n) = \mathcal{A}$  when  $n = 4m + 1$  for some  $m \geq 1$ . Suppose  $n = 4m + 5$ .  $V = \{v_1, \dots, v_{4m+5}\}$ .

$\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_1, v_2)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(v_1, v_3)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_3)$  to make a triangle.  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(v_1, v_4)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_4)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_3, v_4)$  or  $(v_3, v_5)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_4)$ , then vertices  $v_1, v_2, v_3, v_4$  are out of play. The remaining vertices  $v_5, \dots, v_{4m+5}$  have degree zero and it is  $\mathcal{A}$ 's turn. Play continues as in  $\Gamma_{B3,C}(4m + 1)$ , so  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by induction.
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_5)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_5)$ . Now vertices  $v_1, v_2, v_3, v_4$  are out of play.  $z(G_{4m+5,7}) = 4m$ ,  $p(G_{4m+5,7}) = 0$ , and  $t(G_{4m+5,7}) = 1$ . Thus  $G_{4m+5,7} \in \mathcal{K}_2(4m)$ , so  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by Lemma 4.2.

**$n \equiv 2 \pmod{4}$ :**

Suppose  $n = 4m + 2$  for some  $m \geq 1$ .  $V = \{v_1, \dots, v_{4m+2}\}$ . We give a winning strategy for player  $\mathcal{B}$ .

$\mathcal{A}$  must choose  $(v_1, v_2)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_1, v_3)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has three choices:  $(v_1, v_4)$ ,  $(v_2, v_3)$ , or  $(v_2, v_4)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_1, v_4)$  then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_3)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_2, v_3)$  or  $(v_2, v_4)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_1, v_4)$ .

The three possible resulting graphs are isomorphic, so without loss of generality, consider the first case.  $\mathcal{A}$  again has three choices:  $(v_2, v_4)$ ,  $(v_2, v_5)$ , or  $(v_4, v_5)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_4)$  then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_5)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_5)$  then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_4)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_5)$  then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_4)$ .

As above, the three resulting graphs are isomorphic. Without loss of generality, consider the first case.  $\mathcal{A}$  has three choices:  $(v_4, v_5)$ ,  $(v_4, v_6)$ , or  $(v_5, v_6)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_5)$  or  $(v_5, v_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other one. Now vertices  $v_1, v_2, v_3, v_4, v_5$  are out of play.  $z(G_{4m+2,8}) = 4m - 4$ ,  $p(G_{4m+2,8}) = 1$ , and  $t(G_{4m+2,8}) = 0$ . Thus  $G_{4m+2,8} \in \mathcal{K}_3(4m - 4)$ , so  $\mathcal{B}$  wins by Lemma 4.3.
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_6)$  then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_6)$ . Now vertices  $v_1, v_2, v_3, v_4$  are out of play.  $z(G_{4m+2,8}) = 4m - 4$ ,  $p(G_{4m+2,8}) = 0$ , and  $t(G_{4m+2,8}) = 2$  with  $T(G_{4m+2,8}) = \{v_5, v_6\}$ ,  $(v_5, v_6) \in E_8$ . Thus  $G_{4m+2,8} \in \mathcal{K}_1(4m - 4)$ , so  $\mathcal{B}$  wins by Lemma 4.1.

**$n \equiv 3 \pmod{4}$ :**

We proceed by induction on  $n$ .

Base case:  $n = 7$ . This was solved by hand calculation.

Assume for induction that  $f_{\{B3,C\}}(n) = \mathcal{A}$  when  $n = 4m + 3$  for some  $m \geq 1$ . Suppose  $n = 4m + 7$ .  $V = \{v_1, \dots, v_{4m+7}\}$ .

$\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_1, v_2)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(v_1, v_3)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_3)$  to make a triangle.  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(v_1, v_4)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_4)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_3, v_4)$  or  $(v_3, v_5)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_4)$ , then vertices  $v_1, v_2, v_3, v_4$  are out of play. The remaining vertices  $v_5, \dots, v_{4m+7}$  have degree zero and it is  $\mathcal{A}$ 's turn. Play continues as in  $\Gamma_{B3,C}(4m+3)$ , so  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by induction.
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_5)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_5)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(v_5, v_6)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_7)$ . Vertices  $v_1, v_2, v_3, v_4, v_5$  are out of play.  $z(G_{4m+7,9}) = 4m$ ,  $p(G_{4m+7,9}) = 1$ , and  $t(G_{4m+7,9}) = 1$  with  $P(G_{4m+7,9}) = \{v_7\}$  and  $T(G_{4m+7,9}) = \{v_6\}$ ,  $(v_6, v_7) \in E_9$ . Thus  $G_{4m+7,9} \in \mathcal{K}_4(4m)$ , so  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by Lemma 4.4.

□

## 5 $\mathcal{R} = \{B3, T, C\}$

In the game  $\Gamma_{\{B3,T,C\}}$ , we define graph classes  $\mathcal{L}_i(z)$  for  $i=1,2,3$ , where  $z \geq 0$  is an integer. For large enough  $n$ , one player can force that  $G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_1(z)$  early in the game. A few rounds later, the same player can force that  $G_{n,k} \in (\mathcal{L}_2(z) \cup \mathcal{L}_3(z))$ . From here, this player then maintains a periodic method of gameplay, continuously returning to graphs in  $\mathcal{L}_2(z) \cup \mathcal{L}_3(z)$  after a fixed number of rounds. Following this strategy until the end of the game forces a win.

For any graph  $G(V, E)$ , define the set  $F(G)$  to be the set of edges in  $E^c$  that will create a triangle if chosen. That is,

$$F(G) = \{(v_i, v_j) \notin E \mid \exists w \in V \text{ such that } (v_i, w), (v_j, w) \in E\}.$$

Define sets of graphs  $\mathcal{L}_i(z)$  for  $i=1,2,3$  as follows:

1. For any integer  $z \geq 0$ ,  $G(V, E) \in \mathcal{L}_1(z) \iff z(G) = z$  and ONE of the following holds:

- (a)  $p(G) = 1$ ,  $t(G) = 1$ , and if  $u_1 \in P(G)$ ,  $u_2 \in T(G)$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \in F(G)$ ,
- (b)  $p(G) = 1$ ,  $t(G) = 1$ , and if  $u_1 \in P(G)$ ,  $u_2 \in T(G)$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \notin (E \cup F(G))$ ,
- (c)  $p(G) = 0$ ,  $t(G) = 3$ , and, for some ordering of  $T(G)$ , if  $u_1, u_2, u_3 \in T(G)$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \in E$  and  $(u_1, u_3), (u_2, u_3) \in F(G)$ , or
- (d)  $p(G) = 0$ ,  $t(G) = 3$ , and, for some ordering of  $T(G)$ , if  $u_1, u_2, u_3 \in T(G)$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \in E$ ,  $(u_1, u_3) \in F(G)$ , and  $(u_2, u_3) \notin (E \cup F(G))$ .

2. For any integer  $z \geq 0$ ,  $G(V, E) \in \mathcal{L}_2(z) \iff z(G) = z$  and ONE of the following holds:

- (a)  $p(G) = 1$ ,  $t(G) = 1$ , and if  $u_1 \in P(G)$ ,  $u_2 \in T(G)$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \in F(G)$ ,
- (b)  $p(G) = 0$ ,  $t(G) = 2$ , and if  $u_1, u_2 \in T(G)$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \in E$ , or
- (c)  $p(G) = 0$ ,  $t(G) = 2$ , and if  $u_1, u_2 \in T(G)$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \in F(G)$ .

3. For any integer  $z \geq 0$ ,  $G(V, E) \in \mathcal{L}_3(z) \iff z(G) = z$  and ONE of the following holds:

- (a)  $p(G) = 1$  and  $t(G) = 0$ , or
- (b)  $p(G) = 0$ ,  $t(G) = 3$ , and, for some ordering of  $T(G)$ , if  $u_1, u_2, u_3 \in T(G)$ , then  $(u_1, u_2), (u_1, u_3) \in E$ .

In the proof of the following Lemma, the set  $\mathcal{L}_i(z)(j)$  refers to those graphs in  $\mathcal{L}_i(z)$  that result from case (j). For example, the set  $\mathcal{L}_1(z)(a)$  consists of graphs in  $\mathcal{L}_1(z)$  such that case (a) is satisfied: For any integer  $z \geq 0$ ,  $G(V, E) \in \mathcal{L}_1(z)(a) \iff z(G) = z$ ,  $p(G) = 1$ ,  $t(G) = 1$ , and if  $u_1 \in P(G)$ ,  $u_2 \in T(G)$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \in F(G)$ .

**Lemma 5.1.** *In  $\Gamma_{\{B_3, T, C\}}(n)$ ,  $\mathcal{A}$  can choose edges  $e_1, e_3, \dots, e_k$  so that:*

- when  $n \geq 11$  and  $k = 15$ ,  $G_{n,15} \in \mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)$ , or
- when  $n \geq 15$  and  $k = 21$ ,  $G_{n,21} \in \mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)$ .

*Proof.* Let  $n \geq 11$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_1, v_2)$ . Up to isomorphism,  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(v_1, v_3)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_1, v_4)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(v_2, v_5)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_6)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_3, v_5)$  or  $(v_3, v_7)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. Now  $\mathcal{B}$  has six choices:  $(v_4, v_5)$ ,  $(v_4, v_6)$ ,  $(v_4, v_8)$ ,  $(v_5, v_8)$ ,  $(v_6, v_7)$ , or  $(v_6, v_8)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_5)$  or  $(v_4, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_6, v_7)$  or  $(v_6, v_9)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not.  $\mathcal{B}$  has five choices:  $(v_7, v_8)$ ,  $(v_7, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_8, v_9)$ ,  $(v_8, v_{10})$ , and  $(v_9, v_{10})$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_7, v_8)$  or  $(v_8, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_9, v_{10})$  or  $(v_9, v_{11})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(a)$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_7, v_{10})$  or  $(v_8, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_8, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_8, v_{11})$ , or  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ . If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{10})$ ,  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{11})$ . If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{11})$ ,  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{10})$ . If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ ,  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{10})$ . In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(b)$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_{10})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_8, v_9)$ ,  $(v_8, v_{11})$ , or  $(v_9, v_{11})$ . If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_8, v_9)$  or  $(v_8, v_{11})$ ,  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{11})$ ,  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{10})$ . In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(b)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_6)$  or  $(v_5, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_6, v_7)$  or  $(v_6, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_8)$ .

The resulting three graphs have:

1.  $n - 8$  vertices of degree 0, two vertices of degree 1, and two vertices of degree 2,
2. the two vertices of degree 2 are connected by an edge, and
3. for each pair of vertices  $v_i$  and  $v_j$  of degree 1 or 2, not both of degree 2, the distance between  $v_i$  and  $v_j$  is at least 3.

Gameplay is identical in each case, so we may assume the first case.  $\mathcal{B}$  has four choices:  $(v_4, v_7)$ ,  $(v_4, v_9)$ ,  $(v_7, v_8)$ , or  $(v_7, v_9)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_7)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_9)$ .  
If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_7)$ .  
If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_7)$ .

The resulting three graphs have:

1.  $n - 9$  vertices of degree 0, two vertices of degree 1, and one vertex of degree 2, and

2. for each pair of vertices  $v_i$  and  $v_j$  of degree 1 or 2, the distance between  $v_i$  and  $v_j$  is at least 3.

Gameplay is identical in each case, so we may consider the first case.  $\mathcal{B}$  has four choices:  $(v_7, v_8)$ ,  $(v_7, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_8, v_9)$ , or  $(v_8, v_{10})$ .

- \* If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_7, v_8)$  or  $(v_8, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_9, v_{10})$  or  $(v_9, v_{11})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(a)$ .
- \* If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_7, v_{10})$  or  $(v_8, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_8, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_8, v_{11})$ , or  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ . If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{10})$ ,  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{11})$ . If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{11})$ ,  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{10})$ . If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ ,  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{10})$ . In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(b)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_9)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has five choices:  $(v_6, v_7)$ ,  $(v_6, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_7, v_9)$ ,  $(v_7, v_{10})$ , or  $(v_9, v_{10})$ .
  - \* If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_7)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{10})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_9, v_{10})$  or  $(v_9, v_{11})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(a)$ .
  - \* If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_6, v_{10})$  or  $(v_7, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_8, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_8, v_{11})$ , or  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ . If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{10})$ ,  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{11})$ . If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{11})$ ,  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{10})$ . If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ ,  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{10})$ . In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(b)$ .
  - \* If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_7, v_{10})$  or  $(v_9, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has four choices:  $(v_6, v_8)$ ,  $(v_6, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_6, v_{11})$ , or  $(v_9, v_{11})$ .
    - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_6, v_8)$  or  $(v_9, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(a)$ .
    - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_6, v_{10})$  or  $(v_6, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(b)$ .

Now let  $n \geq 15$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_1, v_2)$ . Up to isomorphism,  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(v_1, v_3)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_1, v_4)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(v_2, v_5)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_5)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has four choices:  $(v_2, v_6)$ ,  $(v_4, v_5)$ ,  $(v_4, v_6)$ , or  $(v_5, v_6)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_2, v_6)$  or  $(v_4, v_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. Now  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_3, v_6)$  or  $(v_3, v_7)$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_7)$ . Call this graph  $G_{(1)}^1$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_7)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_5)$ . This graph is isomorphic to  $G_{(1)}^1$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_5)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_6)$ . Now  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_3, v_6)$ ,  $(v_3, v_7)$ , or  $(v_6, v_7)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_7)$ . This graph is isomorphic to  $G_{(1)}^1$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_7)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_6)$ . This graph is isomorphic to  $G_{(1)}^1$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_7)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_6)$ . This graph is isomorphic to  $G_{(1)}^1$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_6)$ . Now  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_2, v_7)$  or  $(v_4, v_7)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. Call this graph  $G_{(2)}^1$ .

We can now examine the two graphs  $G_{(1)}^1$  and  $G_{(2)}^1$ .

**Case 1.1:**  $G_{n,9} = G_{(1)}^1$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_5, v_7)$ ,  $(v_5, v_8)$ , or  $(v_7, v_8)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_7)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_8)$ . Call this graph  $G_{(1)}^2$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_5, v_8)$  or  $(v_7, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(2)}^2$ .

**Case 1.2:**  $G_{n,9} = G_{(2)}^1$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_3, v_7)$ ,  $(v_3, v_8)$ , or  $(v_6, v_8)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_3, v_7)$  or  $(v_6, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. This graph is isomorphic to  $G_{(1)}^2$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_9)$ . Call this graph  $G_{(3)}^2$ .

Now we look at the three graphs  $G_{(i)}^2$ , for  $i = 1, 2, 3$ .

**Case 2.1:**  $G_{n,11} = G_{(1)}^2$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(v_8, v_9)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{10})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(v_9, v_{11})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_9, v_{12})$  or  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ .

If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{12})$ ,  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$ .

If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ ,  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{13})$ .

The resulting two graphs are isomorphic, so without loss of generality we may consider the first case.  $\mathcal{B}$  has five choices:  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ ,  $(v_{10}, v_{14})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , or  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(a)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{10}, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ , or  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ .  
 The resulting three graphs are in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(b)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{14})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ , or  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ .

If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.

If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ .

The resulting two graphs are in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(b)$ .

**Case 2.2:**  $G_{n,11} = G_{(2)}^2$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(v_7, v_9)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{10})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_9, v_{10})$  or  $(v_9, v_{11})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not.  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$  or  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not.  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(a)$ .

**Case 2.3:**  $G_{n,11} = G_{(3)}^2$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has four choices:  $(v_7, v_8)$ ,  $(v_7, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_8, v_9)$ , or  $(v_8, v_{10})$ .

**Subcase 2.3.1:** If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_7, v_8)$  or  $(v_8, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(v_9, v_{10})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$  or  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ .

If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$ .

If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{13})$ .

The resulting two graphs are isomorphic, so without loss of generality we may consider the first case.  $\mathcal{B}$  has four choices:  $(v_{11}, v_{14})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , or  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{11}, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has four choices:  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ ,  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ , or  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(b)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$  or  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(c)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{11}, v_{14})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has four choices:  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ ,  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ , or  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$  or  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(b)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ . The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(c)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ . The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(d)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_{11}, v_{15})$  or  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(d)$ .

**Subcase 2.3.2:** If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{11})$ .

If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_{11})$ .

The two resulting graphs are isomorphic, so without loss of generality we may consider the first case.  $\mathcal{B}$  has six choices:  $(v_8, v_9)$ ,  $(v_8, v_{12})$ ,  $(v_9, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_9, v_{11})$ ,  $(v_9, v_{12})$ , or  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_8, v_9)$  or  $(v_9, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(1)}^3$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_8, v_{12})$  or  $(v_9, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(2)}^3$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_9, v_{11})$  or  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(3)}^3$ .

All that remains is for us to look at the three graphs  $G_{(i)}^3$ , for  $i = 1, 2, 3$ .

**Case 3.1:**  $G_{n,15} = G_{(1)}^3$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$  or  $(v_{10}, v_{13})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not.  $\mathcal{B}$  has five choices:  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$ ,  $(v_{11}, v_{14})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , or  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$  or  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(a)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{11}, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ , or  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ . The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(b)$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$  or  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(d)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{11}, v_{14})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ , or  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ . The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(b)$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$  or  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(d)$ .

**Case 3.2:**  $G_{n,15} = G_{(2)}^3$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_9, v_{11})$ ,  $(v_9, v_{13})$ , or  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$ .

**Subcase 3.2.1:** If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_9, v_{11})$  or  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has five choices:  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ ,  $(v_{10}, v_{14})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ , or  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(a)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{10}, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ , or  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ .  
 The resulting three graphs are in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(b)$ .

**Subcase 3.2.2:** If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has five choices:  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$ ,  $(v_{11}, v_{14})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , or  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$  or  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(a)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{11}, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ , or  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ . The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(b)$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$  or  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(d)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{11}, v_{14})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ , or  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ . The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(b)$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$  or  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(d)$ .

**Case 3.3:**  $G_{n,15} = G_{(3)}^3$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has five choices:  $(v_8, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_8, v_{13})$ ,  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ ,  $(v_{10}, v_{13})$ , or  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ .

**Subcase 3.3.1:** If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_8, v_{10})$  or  $(v_{10}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has five choices:  $(v_9, v_{13})$ ,  $(v_9, v_{14})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , or  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_9, v_{13})$  or  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(a)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_9, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ , or  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ . The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(b)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$  or  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(d)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{14})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ , or  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ . The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(b)$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$  or  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(d)$ .

**Subcase 3.3.2:** If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{10})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has five choices:  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ ,  $(v_{10}, v_{14})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ , or  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(a)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{10}, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ ,  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ , or  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{14})$ .
 The resulting three graphs are in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(b)$ .

**Subcase 3.3.3:** If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has five choices:  $(v_8, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_8, v_{13})$ ,  $(v_8, v_{14})$ ,  $(v_{10}, v_{14})$ , or  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{14})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(a)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{14})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_{10}, v_{14})$ ,  $(v_{10}, v_{15})$ , or  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{14}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{14})$ .
 The resulting three graphs are in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(b)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{10})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(a)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(v_{10}, v_{14})$  or  $(v_{13}, v_{14})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(v_8, v_{13})$ ,  $(v_8, v_{15})$ , or  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{15})$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{13})$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{13}, v_{15})$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{14})$ .  
 The resulting three graphs are in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)(b)$ .

□

**Lemma 5.2.** *In  $\Gamma_{\{\mathcal{B}, \mathcal{T}, \mathcal{C}\}}(n)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  can choose edges  $e_2, e_4, \dots, e_k$  so that:*

- when  $n \geq 9$  and  $k=12$ ,  $G_{n,12} \in \mathcal{L}_1(n - 9)$ , or
- when  $n \geq 13$  and  $k=18$ ,  $G_{n,18} \in \mathcal{L}_1(n - 13)$ .

*Proof.* Let  $n \geq 9$ . Up to isomorphism,  $\mathcal{A}$  must choose  $(v_1, v_2)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_1, v_3)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has two choices:  $(v_1, v_4)$  or  $(v_2, v_4)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_1, v_4)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_5)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_4)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_1, v_5)$ .

The two resulting graphs are isomorphic, so without loss of generality we may consider the first case.  $\mathcal{A}$  has four choices:  $(v_2, v_6)$ ,  $(v_3, v_5)$ ,  $(v_3, v_6)$ , or  $(v_5, v_6)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_2, v_6)$  or  $(v_3, v_5)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge.  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_5)$ .  
 The two resulting graphs are isomorphic, so without loss of generality, we may consider the first case.  $\mathcal{A}$  has four choices:  $(v_3, v_6)$ ,  $(v_3, v_7)$ ,  $(v_4, v_6)$ , or  $(v_4, v_7)$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_7)$ . Call this graph  $G_{(1)}$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_3, v_7)$  or  $(v_4, v_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(2)}$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_7)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_7)$ . This graph is isomorphic to  $G_{(2)}$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_5)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has three choices:  $(v_2, v_7)$ ,  $(v_4, v_6)$ , or  $(v_4, v_7)$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_2, v_7)$  or  $(v_4, v_7)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. This graph is isomorphic to  $G_{(2)}$  above.
  - If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_7)$ . Call this graph  $G_{(3)}$ .

We can now examine the three graphs  $G_{(i)}$  for  $i = 1, 2, 3$ .

**Case 1:**  $G_{n,8} = G_{(1)}$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has four choices:  $(v_4, v_6)$ ,  $(v_4, v_7)$ ,  $(v_4, v_8)$ , or  $(v_6, v_8)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_6)$  or  $(v_4, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{A}$  has two choices:  $(v_7, v_8)$  or  $(v_7, v_9)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{A}$  did not. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(a)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_7)$  or  $(v_6, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{A}$  has three choices:  $(v_4, v_8)$ ,  $(v_4, v_9)$ , or  $(v_8, v_9)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_8)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_9)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_9)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_8)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_9)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_8)$ .  
 In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(b)$ .

**Case 2:**  $G_{n,8} = G_{(2)}$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has seven choices:  $(v_4, v_5)$ ,  $(v_4, v_7)$ ,  $(v_4, v_8)$ ,  $(v_5, v_8)$ ,  $(v_6, v_7)$ ,  $(v_6, v_8)$ , or  $(v_7, v_8)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_5)$  or  $(v_6, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{A}$  has two choices:  $(v_7, v_8)$  or  $(v_7, v_9)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{A}$  did not. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(a)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_7)$  or  $(v_5, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{A}$  has three choices:  $(v_6, v_8)$ ,  $(v_6, v_9)$ , or  $(v_8, v_9)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_8)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_9)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_9)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_8)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_9)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_8)$ .  
 In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(b)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_8)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has three choices:  $(v_6, v_7)$ ,  $(v_6, v_9)$ , or  $(v_7, v_9)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_7)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_9)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_9)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_8)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_9)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_7)$ .  
 In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(b)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_7)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_8)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has three choices:  $(v_5, v_8)$ ,  $(v_5, v_9)$ , or  $(v_8, v_9)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_8)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_9)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_9)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_8)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_9)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_8)$ .  
 In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(b)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_7)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has three choices:  $(v_5, v_8)$ ,  $(v_5, v_9)$ , or  $(v_8, v_9)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_8)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_9)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_9)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_8)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_9)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_8)$ .  
 In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(b)$ .

**Case 3:**  $G_{n,8} = G_{(3)}$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has five choices:  $(v_3, v_7)$ ,  $(v_3, v_8)$ ,  $(v_4, v_7)$ ,  $(v_4, v_8)$ , or  $(v_7, v_8)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_3, v_7)$  or  $(v_7, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{A}$  has three choices:  $(v_4, v_8)$ ,  $(v_4, v_9)$ , or  $(v_8, v_9)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_8)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_9)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_9)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_8)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_9)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_8)$ .  
 In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(b)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_3, v_8)$  or  $(v_4, v_7)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{A}$  has three choices:  $(v_6, v_8)$ ,  $(v_6, v_9)$ , or  $(v_8, v_9)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_8)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_9)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_9)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_8)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_9)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_8)$ .  
 In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(b)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_8)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has three choices:  $(v_6, v_7)$ ,  $(v_6, v_9)$ , or  $(v_7, v_9)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_7)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_9)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_9)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_8)$ .  
 If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_9)$ ,  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_7)$ .  
 In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 11)(b)$ .

Now let  $n \geq 13$ . Up to isomorphism,  $\mathcal{A}$  must choose  $(v_1, v_2)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_1, v_3)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has two choices:  $(v_1, v_4)$  or  $(v_2, v_4)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_1, v_4)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_5)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_4)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_1, v_5)$ .

The two resulting graphs are isomorphic, so without loss of generality we may assume the first case.  $\mathcal{A}$  has four choices:  $(v_2, v_6)$ ,  $(v_3, v_5)$ ,  $(v_3, v_6)$ , or  $(v_5, v_6)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_7)$ .  
If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_7)$ .  
If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_2, v_7)$ .

The three resulting graphs are isomorphic, so without loss of generality we may assume the first case.  $\mathcal{A}$  has eight choices:  $(v_3, v_5)$ ,  $(v_3, v_8)$ ,  $(v_4, v_5)$ ,  $(v_4, v_7)$ ,  $(v_4, v_8)$ ,  $(v_5, v_7)$ ,  $(v_5, v_8)$ , or  $(v_7, v_8)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_3, v_5)$  or  $(v_4, v_5)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(1)}^1$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_3, v_8)$  or  $(v_5, v_7)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(2)}^1$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_7)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_7)$ . Call this graph  $G_{(3)}^1$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_8)$  or  $(v_7, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(4)}^1$ .
  - If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_7)$ . This graph is isomorphic to  $G_{(2)}^1$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_5)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_5)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  must choose  $(v_2, v_6)$ . Then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_7)$ . This graph is isomorphic to  $G_{(1)}^1$ .

Now we need to consider the four graphs  $G_{(i)}^1$  for  $i = 1, 2, 3, 4$ .

**Case 1.1:**  $G_{n,8} = G_{(1)}^1$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has four choices:  $(v_4, v_6)$ ,  $(v_4, v_8)$ ,  $(v_6, v_7)$ , or  $(v_6, v_8)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_6)$  or  $(v_6, v_7)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(1)}^2$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_9)$ .  
If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_9)$ .

The two resulting graphs are isomorphic, so without loss of generality we may consider the first case. Call this graph  $G_{(2)}^2$ .

**Case 1.2:**  $G_{n,8} = G_{(2)}^1$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has seven choices:

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_5)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_9)$ .  
If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_9)$ .  
If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_7)$ .

The three resulting graphs are isomorphic, so we may consider the first case. Call this graph  $G_{(3)}^2$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_9)$ .  
If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_9)$  or  $(v_5, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge.  
If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_9)$ .

The three resulting graphs satisfy:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 9, 2, 3)$ ,
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_3, u_4, u_5\}$ , then, up to isomorphism,  $(u_3, u_4) \in E(G)$ ,  $(u_1, u_5), (u_4, u_5) \in F(G)$ , and all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical in each case, so we may consider the first case. Call this graph  $G_{(4)}^2$ .

**Case 1.3:**  $G_{n,8} = G_{(3)}^1$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has four choices:  $(v_3, v_6)$ ,  $(v_3, v_8)$ ,  $(v_5, v_8)$ , or  $(v_6, v_8)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_6)$ . This graph is isomorphic to  $G_{(1)}^2$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_9)$ . This graph is isomorphic to  $G_{(3)}^2$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_9)$ . This graph is isomorphic to  $G_{(3)}^2$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_9)$ . Call this graph  $G_{(5)}^2$ .

**Case 1.4:**  $G_{n,8} = G_{(4)}^1$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has five choices:  $(v_3, v_5)$ ,  $(v_3, v_9)$ ,  $(v_5, v_7)$ ,  $(v_5, v_9)$ , or  $(v_7, v_9)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_3, v_5)$  or  $(v_5, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(6)}^2$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_9)$ . This graph is isomorphic to  $G_{(5)}^2$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_7)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_9)$ . This graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 9, 2, 3)$ ,
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_3, u_4, u_5\}$ , then, up to isomorphism,  $(u_3, u_4) \in E(G)$ ,  $(u_1, u_5), (u_4, u_5) \in F(G)$ , and all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(4)}^2$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_9)$ . This graph is isomorphic to  $G_{(5)}^2$ .

We now need to look at the graphs  $G_{(i)}^2$  for  $1 \leq i \leq 6$ .

**Case 2.1:**  $G_{n,10} = G_{(1)}^2$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  must choose  $(v_7, v_8)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_9)$ . Call this graph  $G_{(1)}^3$ .

**Case 2.2:**  $G_{n,10} = G_{(2)}^2$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has six choices:  $(v_6, v_7)$ ,  $(v_6, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_7, v_8)$ ,  $(v_7, v_9)$ ,  $(v_7, v_{10})$ , or  $(v_9, v_{10})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_6, v_7)$  or  $(v_7, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(2)}^3$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_6, v_{10})$  or  $(v_7, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(3)}^3$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_7, v_9)$  or  $(v_9, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(4)}^3$ .

**Case 2.3:**  $G_{n,10} = G_{(3)}^2$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has four choices:  $(v_4, v_6)$ ,  $(v_4, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_6, v_8)$ , or  $(v_6, v_{10})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_6)$  or  $(v_6, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. This graph satisfies:
  1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 10, 3, 0)$ , and
  2. for each pair  $u_1, u_2 \in P(G)$ ,  $(u_1, u_2) \notin (E(G) \cup F(G))$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(2)}^3$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_{10})$  or  $(v_6, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(5)}^3$ .

**Case 2.4:**  $G_{n,10} = G_{(4)}^2$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has twelve choices:  $(v_4, v_5)$ ,  $(v_4, v_8)$ ,  $(v_4, v_9)$ ,  $(v_4, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_5, v_8)$ ,  $(v_5, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_6, v_8)$ ,  $(v_6, v_9)$ ,  $(v_6, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_8, v_9)$ ,  $(v_8, v_{10})$ , or  $(v_9, v_{10})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_5)$  or  $(v_6, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. This graph satisfies:
  1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 10, 3, 0)$ , and
  2. for each pair  $u_1, u_2 \in P(G)$ ,  $(u_1, u_2) \notin (E(G) \cup F(G))$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(2)}^3$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_8)$  or  $(v_5, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge.

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_{10})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_{10})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_{10})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_{10})$ .

In each case, the resulting graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 10, 2, 2)$ ,
2. if  $T(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \in F(G)$ , and
3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical in each case, so we may consider the first one. Call this graph  $G_{(6)}^3$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_5, v_8)$  or  $(v_8, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. This graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 10, 2, 2)$ ,
2. if  $T(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \in E(G)$ , and
3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(5)}^3$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses or  $(v_5, v_{10})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses or  $(v_5, v_{10})$ .

These two graphs are isomorphic, so we may consider the first case. Call this graph  $G_{(7)}^3$ .

**Case 2.5:**  $G_{n,10} = G_{(5)}^2$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has three choices:  $(v_3, v_8)$ ,  $(v_3, v_{10})$ , or  $(v_8, v_{10})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_3, v_8)$  or  $(v_8, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. This graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 10, 2, 2)$ ,
2. if  $T(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \in F(G)$ , and
3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(6)}^3$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_3, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_{10})$ . Call this graph  $G_{(8)}^3$ .

**Case 2.6:**  $G_{n,10} = G_{(6)}^2$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has six choices:  $(v_4, v_6)$ ,  $(v_4, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_6, v_8)$ ,  $(v_6, v_9)$ ,  $(v_6, v_{10})$ , or  $(v_8, v_{10})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_6)$  or  $(v_6, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. This graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 10, 2, 2)$ ,
2. if  $T(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \in E(G)$ , and
3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(5)}^3$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_{10})$  or  $(v_6, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. This graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 10, 2, 2)$ ,

2. if  $T(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \in F(G)$ , and
3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(6)}^3$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_6, v_9)$  or  $(v_8, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(9)}^3$ .

Now let us consider the graphs  $G_{(i)}^3$  for  $1 \leq i \leq 9$ .

**Case 3.1:**  $G_{n,12} = G_{(1)}^3$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has two choices:  $(v_8, v_{10})$  or  $(v_9, v_{10})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{11})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{11})$ .

The two resulting graphs are isomorphic, so we may consider the first case. Call this graph  $G_{(1)}^4$ .

**Case 3.2:**  $G_{n,12} = G_{(2)}^3$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has two choices:  $(v_8, v_9)$  or  $(v_8, v_{11})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{A}$  did not. Call this graph  $G_{(2)}^4$ .

**Case 3.3:**  $G_{n,12} = G_{(3)}^3$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has three choices:  $(v_7, v_9)$ ,  $(v_7, v_{11})$ , or  $(v_9, v_{11})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_7, v_9)$  or  $(v_9, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(3)}^4$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_9)$ . This graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 11, 2, 1)$ ,
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_3\}$ , then, up to isomorphism,  $(u_1, u_3) \in F(G)$ , and
3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(2)}^4$ .

**Case 3.4:**  $G_{n,12} = G_{(4)}^3$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has five choices:  $(v_6, v_8)$ ,  $(v_6, v_{11})$ ,  $(v_8, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_8, v_{11})$ , or  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_6, v_8)$  or  $(v_8, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. This graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 11, 2, 1)$ ,
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_3\}$ , then, up to isomorphism,  $(u_1, u_3) \in F(G)$ , and
3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(2)}^4$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_8)$ . This graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 11, 2, 1)$ , and
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_3\}$ , then all pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(3)}^4$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_8, v_{10})$  or  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(4)}^4$ .

**Case 3.5:**  $G_{n,12} = G_{(5)}^3$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has four choices:  $(v_6, v_9)$ ,  $(v_6, v_{11})$ ,  $(v_9, v_{10})$ , or  $(v_9, v_{11})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{11})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_9)$ .

In each case, the resulting graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 11, 2, 1)$ , and
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_3\}$ , then all pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(3)}^4$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_6, v_{11})$  or  $(v_9, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(5)}^4$ .

**Case 3.6:**  $G_{n,12} = G_{(6)}^3$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has four choices:  $(v_6, v_9)$ ,  $(v_6, v_{11})$ ,  $(v_9, v_{10})$ , or  $(v_9, v_{11})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{11})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_9)$ .

In each case, the resulting graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 11, 2, 1)$ , and
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_3\}$ , then all pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(3)}^4$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_9, v_{10})$  or  $(v_9, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. This graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 11, 1, 3)$ ,
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, \}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_2, u_3, u_4\}$ , then, up to isomorphism,  $(u_1, u_2), (u_3, u_4) \in F(G)$ , and
3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(4)}^4$ .

**Case 3.7:**  $G_{n,12} = G_{(7)}^3$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has four choices:  $(v_4, v_8)$ ,  $(v_4, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_4, v_{11})$ , or  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_{11})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_8)$ .

In each case, the resulting graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 11, 2, 1)$ , and
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_3\}$ , then all pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(3)}^4$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_8)$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_{10})$ .

In each case, the resulting graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 11, 1, 3)$ ,
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_2, u_3, u_4\}$ , then, up to isomorphism,  $(u_2, u_3) \in E(G)$ , and
3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical in each case, so we can consider the first case. Call this graph  $G_{(6)}^4$ .

**Case 3.8:**  $G_{n,12} = G_{(8)}^3$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has four choices:  $(v_5, v_8)$ ,  $(v_5, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_5, v_{11})$ , or  $(v_8, v_{11})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_5, v_8)$  or  $(v_8, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. This graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 11, 2, 1)$ , and
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_3\}$ , then all pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(3)}^4$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{11})$ . This graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 11, 2, 1)$ ,
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_3\}$ , then, up to isomorphism,  $(u_1, u_3) \in E(G)$ ,  $(u_2, u_3) \in F(G)$ , and
3.  $(u_1, u_3) \in (E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(1)}^4$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_5, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{10})$ . This graph satisfies:
  1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 11, 2, 1)$ ,
  2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_3\}$ , then, up to isomorphism,  $(u_1, u_3) \in F(G)$ , and
  3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(2)}^4$ .

**Case 3.9:**  $G_{n,12} = G_{(9)}^3$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has five choices:  $(v_4, v_6)$ ,  $(v_4, v_{11})$ ,  $(v_6, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_6, v_{11})$ , or  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_{11})$ .  
If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_7)$ .  
In each case, the resulting graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 11, 2, 1)$ , and
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_3\}$ , then all pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(3)}^4$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_9)$ . Call this graph  $G_{(7)}^4$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_6, v_{11})$  or  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(8)}^4$ .

Now we consider the graphs  $G_{(i)}^4$  for  $1 \leq i \leq 8$ .

**Case 4.1:**  $G_{n,14} = G_{(1)}^4$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has four choices:  $(v_9, v_{12})$ ,  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ ,  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ , or  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_9, v_{12})$  or  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge.  
If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{12})$ .  
In each case, the resulting graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 12, 1, 2)$ ,
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_2, u_3\}$ , then, up to isomorphism,  $(u_2, u_3) \in E(G)$ ,  $(u_1, u_2) \in F(G)$ , and
3.  $(u_1, u_3) \in (E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical in each case, so we may consider the first case. Call this graph  $G_{(1)}^5$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ . Call this graph  $G_{(2)}^5$ .

**Case 4.2:**  $G_{n,14} = G_{(2)}^4$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has five choices:  $(v_9, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_9, v_{12})$ ,  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ ,  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ , or  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_9, v_{10})$  or  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(3)}^5$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_9, v_{12})$  or  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{12})$ .

In each case, the resulting graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 12, 1, 2)$ ,
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_2, u_3\}$ , then  $(u_2, u_3) \in E(G)$ , and
3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical in each case, so we may consider the first case. Call this graph  $G_{(4)}^5$ .

**Case 4.3:**  $G_{n,14} = G_{(3)}^4$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has four choices:  $(v_8, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_8, v_{12})$ ,  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ , or  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_8, v_{10})$  or  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. This graph satisfies:
  1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 12, 2, 0)$ , and
  2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \in (E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(3)}^5$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_8, v_{12})$  or  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. This graph satisfies:
  1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 12, 1, 2)$ ,
  2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_2, u_3\}$ , then  $(u_2, u_3) \in E(G)$ , and
  3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(4)}^5$ .

**Case 4.4:**  $G_{n,14} = G_{(4)}^4$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has five choices:  $(v_6, v_8)$ ,  $(v_6, v_{11})$ ,  $(v_6, v_{12})$ ,  $(v_8, v_{12})$ , or  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_{12})$ .  
If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_8)$ .

In each case, the resulting graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 12, 2, 0)$ , and
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \in (E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(3)}^5$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_{12})$ . Call this graph  $G_{(5)}^5$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_8, v_{12})$  or  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(6)}^5$ .

**Case 4.5:**  $G_{n,14} = G_{(5)}^4$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has five choices:  $(v_8, v_9)$ ,  $(v_8, v_{12})$ ,  $(v_9, v_{11})$ ,  $(v_9, v_{12})$ , or  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ . This graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 12, 2, 0)$ , and
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \in (E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(3)}^5$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_8, v_{12})$  or  $(v_9, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. This graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 12, 1, 2)$ ,
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_2, u_3\}$ , then  $(u_2, u_3) \in F(G)$ , and
3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(5)}^5$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_9, v_{12})$  or  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. Call this graph  $G_{(7)}^5$ .

**Case 4.6:**  $G_{n,14} = G_{(6)}^4$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has six choices:  $(v_8, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_8, v_{11})$ ,  $(v_8, v_{12})$ ,  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ ,  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ , or  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{10})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{12})$ .  
If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{10})$ .

In each case, the resulting graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 12, 2, 0)$ , and
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \in (E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(3)}^5$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_8, v_{11})$  or  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. This graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 12, 1, 2)$ ,
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_2, u_3\}$ , then  $(u_2, u_3) \in F(G)$ , and
3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(5)}^5$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$  or  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. This graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 12, 1, 2)$ ,
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_2, u_3\}$ , then  $(u_2, u_3) \in E(G)$ , and
3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(4)}^5$ .

**Case 4.7:**  $G_{n,14} = G_{(7)}^4$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  must choose  $(v_7, v_{11})$ . Then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ . This graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 12, 2, 0)$ , and
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1, u_2\}$ , then  $(u_1, u_2) \in (E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(3)}^5$ .

**Case 4.8:**  $G_{n,14} = G_{(8)}^4$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has seven choices:  $(v_4, v_9)$ ,  $(v_4, v_{11})$ ,  $(v_4, v_{12})$ ,  $(v_9, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_9, v_{12})$ ,  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ , or  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_9)$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_{12})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_9)$ .

In each case, the resulting graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 12, 1, 2)$ ,
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_2, u_3\}$ , then  $(u_2, u_3) \in E(G)$ , and
3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(4)}^5$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_4, v_{11})$  or  $(v_9, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge.  
If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_9, v_{10})$  or  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge.  
In each case, the resulting graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (n - 12, 1, 2)$ ,
2. if  $P(G) = \{u_1\}$  and  $T(G) = \{u_2, u_3\}$ , then  $(u_2, u_3) \in F(G)$ , and
3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical to that of  $G_{(5)}^5$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_9, v_{12})$ . Call this graph  $G_{(8)}^5$ .

Finally, we look at the graphs  $G_{(i)}^5$  for  $1 \leq i \leq 8$ .

**Case 5.1:**  $G_{n,16} = G_{(1)}^5$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has four choices:  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ ,  $(v_{10}, v_{13})$ ,  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$ , or  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$  or  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 13)(b)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_{10}, v_{13})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 13)(c)$ .

**Case 5.2:**  $G_{n,16} = G_{(2)}^5$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has two choices:  $(v_9, v_{13})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{A}$  did not. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 13)(d)$ .

**Case 5.3:**  $G_{n,16} = G_{(3)}^5$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has two choices:  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$  or  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{A}$  did not. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 13)(a)$ .

**Case 5.4:**  $G_{n,16} = G_{(4)}^5$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has three choices:  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ ,  $(v_{10}, v_{13})$ , or  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$ . The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 13)(b)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_{10}, v_{13})$  or  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 13)(d)$ .

**Case 5.5:**  $G_{n,16} = G_{(5)}^5$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has three choices:  $(v_8, v_{12})$ ,  $(v_8, v_{13})$ , or  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{11}, v_{12})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{12}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{12})$ .

In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 13)(b)$ .

**Case 5.6:**  $G_{n,16} = G_{(6)}^5$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has three choices:  $(v_6, v_{11})$ ,  $(v_6, v_{13})$ , or  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_{13})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_{11})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_6, v_{12})$ .

In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 13)(b)$ .

**Case 5.7:**  $G_{n,16} = G_{(7)}^5$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has four choices:  $(v_8, v_{10})$ ,  $(v_8, v_{12})$ ,  $(v_8, v_{13})$ , or  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$ .

- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses one of  $(v_8, v_{10})$  or  $(v_{11}, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses the other edge. The resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 13)(a)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{12})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{13})$ .  
If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_8, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_{10}, v_{11})$ .  
In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 13)(b)$ .

**Case 5.8:**  $G_{n,16} = G_{(8)}^5$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  has two choices:  $(v_4, v_{11})$  or  $(v_4, v_{13})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_{11})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_{13})$ .

If  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(v_4, v_{13})$ , then  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(v_7, v_{11})$ .

In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(n - 13)(b)$ . □

**Lemma 5.3.** For  $n \geq 3$ , in  $\Gamma_{\{B_3, T, C\}}(n)$ , if either player chooses an edge  $e_k$  that creates a graph  $G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_1(z)$ , then

- when  $z \geq 1$ , that player can choose an edge  $e_{k+2}$  so that  $G_{n,k+2} \in (\mathcal{L}_2(z - 1) \cup \mathcal{L}_3(z - 1))$ , or
- when  $z \geq 4$ , that player can choose edges  $e_{k+2}, e_{k+4}, e_{k+6}$  so that  $G_{n,k+6} \in (\mathcal{L}_2(z - 4) \cup \mathcal{L}_3(z - 4))$ .

*Proof.* Let  $n \geq 3$ . Suppose the edges  $e_1, \dots, e_{k-1}$  have already been chosen. Suppose player  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the  $k$ th edge so that  $G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_1(z)$  with  $z \geq 1$ . Let  $w_1 \in Z(G_{n,k})$ . Each vertex  $v \notin (Z(G_{n,k}) \cup P(G_{n,k}) \cup T(G_{n,k}))$  has  $\deg_{G_{n,k}}(v) = 3$  and is out of play. The strategy described here will work for  $\mathcal{B}$  as well.

$G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_1(z)(a)$ :

Let  $P(G_{n,k}) = \{u_1\}$  and  $T(G_{n,k}) = \{u_2\}$  with  $(u_1, u_2) \in F(G_{n,k})$ . Up to isomorphism,  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(u_1, w_1)$  or  $(u_2, w_1)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. Now  $u_2$  is out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+2}) = z(G_{n,k}) - 1 = z - 1$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+2}) = 0$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+2}) = \{u_1, w_1\}$ , and  $(u_1, w_1) \in E_{k+2}$ . So  $G_{n,k+2} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z - 1)(b)$ .

$G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_1(z)(b)$ :

Let  $P(G_{n,k}) = \{u_1\}$  and  $T(G_{n,k}) = \{u_2\}$  with  $(u_1, u_2) \notin (E_k \cup F(G_{n,k}))$ . Up to isomorphism,  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(u_1, u_2)$ ,  $(u_1, w_1)$ , or  $(u_2, w_1)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(u_1, u_2)$  then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(u_1, w_1)$ . Now  $u_1, u_2$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+2}) = z(G_{n,k}) - 1 = z - 1$ ,  $P(G_{n,k+2}) = \{w_1\}$ , and  $t(G_{n,k+2}) = 0$ . So  $G_{n,k+2} \in \mathcal{L}_3(z - 1)(a)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(u_1, w_1)$  or  $(u_2, w_1)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. This case is identical to the above case  $G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_1(z)(a)$  and  $G_{n,k+2} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z - 1)(b)$ .

$G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_1(z)(c)$ :

Let  $T(G_{n,k}) = \{u_1, u_2, u_3\}$  with  $(u_1, u_2) \in E_k$  and  $(u_1, u_3), (u_2, u_3) \in F(G_{n,k})$ . Note that  $p(G_{n,k}) = 0$ . Up to isomorphism,  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(u_1, w_1)$  or  $(u_3, w_1)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. Now  $u_1, u_3$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+2}) = z(G_{n,k}) - 1 = z - 1$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+2}) = 0$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+2}) = \{u_2, w_1\}$ , and  $(u_2, w_1) \in F(G_{n,k+2})$ . So  $G_{n,k+2} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z - 1)(c)$ .

$G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_1(z)(d)$ :

Let  $u_1, u_2, u_3 \in T(G)$ , with  $(u_1, u_2) \in E$ ,  $(u_1, u_3) \in F(G)$ , and  $(u_2, u_3) \notin (E \cup F(G))$ . Note that  $p(G_{n,k}) = 0$ . Up to isomorphism,  $\mathcal{B}$  has four choices:  $(u_1, w_1)$ ,  $(u_2, u_3)$ ,  $(u_2, w_1)$ , or  $(u_3, w_1)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(u_1, w_1)$  or  $(u_2, u_3)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. Now  $u_1, u_2, u_3$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+2}) = z(G_{n,k}) - 1 = z - 1$ ,  $P(G_{n,k+2}) = \{w_1\}$ , and  $t(G_{n,k+2}) = 0$ . So  $G_{n,k+2} \in \mathcal{L}_3(z - 1)(a)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(u_2, w_1)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(u_3, w_1)$ . Now  $u_2, u_3$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+2}) = z(G_{n,k}) - 1 = z - 1$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+2}) = 0$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+2}) = \{u_1, w_1\}$ , and  $(u_1, w_1) \in F(G_{n,k+2})$ . So  $G_{n,k+2} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z - 1)(c)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(u_3, w_1)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(u_1, w_1)$ . Now  $u_1, u_3$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+2}) = z(G_{n,k}) - 1 = z - 1$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+2}) = 0$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+2}) = \{u_2, w_1\}$ , and  $(u_2, w_1) \in F(G_{n,k+2})$ . So  $G_{n,k+2} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z - 1)(c)$ .

Now suppose player  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the  $k$ th edge so that  $G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_1(z)$  with  $z \geq 4$ . Let  $w_1, w_2, w_3, w_4 \in Z(G_{n,k})$ .

$G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_1(z)(a)$ :

$\mathcal{A}$  chooses the edge  $e_{k+2}$  as above. Now  $G_{n,k+2} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z - 1)(b)$  with  $z(G_{n,k+2}) = z - 1$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+2}) = 0$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+2}) = \{u_1, w_1\}$ , and  $(u_1, w_1) \in E_{k+2}$ . Up to game play equivalence,  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(u_1, w_2)$ . Then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_1, w_3)$ . Now  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(w_2, w_3)$  or  $(w_2, w_4)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. Now  $u_1, w_1, w_2$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+6}) = z(G_{n,k}) - 4 = z - 4$ ,  $P(G_{n,k+6}) = \{w_4\}$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+6}) = \{w_3\}$ , and  $(w_3, w_4) \in F(G_{n,k+6})$ . So  $G_{n,k+6} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z - 4)(a)$ .

$G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_1(z)(b)$ :

$\mathcal{A}$  chooses the edge  $e_{k+2}$  as above. Now we have two cases.

1.  $G_{n,k+2} \in \mathcal{L}_3(z - 1)(a)$  with  $z(G_{n,k+2}) = z - 1$ ,  $P(G_{n,k+2}) = \{w_1\}$ , and  $t(G_{n,k+2}) = 0$ . Up to isomorphism,  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(w_1, w_2)$ . Then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_1, w_3)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(w_2, w_4)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_3, w_4)$ . Now  $w_1$  is out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+6}) = z(G_{n,k}) - 4 = z - 4$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+6}) = 0$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+6}) = \{w_2, w_3, w_4\}$ , and  $(w_2, w_4), (w_3, w_4) \in E_{k+6}$ . So  $G_{n,k+6} \in \mathcal{L}_3(z - 4)(b)$ .
2.  $G_{n,k+2} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z - 1)(b)$  with  $z(G_{n,k+2}) = z - 1$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+2}) = 0$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+2}) = \{u_1, w_1\}$ , and  $(u_1, w_1) \in E_{k+2}$ . This case is identical to  $G_{n,k+2} \in \mathcal{L}_1(z)(a)$  above and  $\mathcal{A}$  follows the same pattern.

$G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_1(z)(c)$ :

$\mathcal{A}$  chooses the edge  $e_{k+2}$  as above. Now  $G_{n,k+2} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z - 1)(c)$  with  $z(G_{n,k+2}) = z - 1$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+2}) = 0$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+2}) = \{u_2, w_1\}$ , and  $(u_2, w_1) \in F(G_{n,k+2})$ . Up to game play equivalence,  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(u_2, w_2)$ . Then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_1, w_3)$ . Now  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(w_2, w_3)$  or  $(w_2, w_4)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. Now  $u_1, w_1, w_2$  are

out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+6}) = z(G_{n,k}) - 4 = z - 4$ ,  $P(G_{n,k+6}) = \{w_4\}$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+6}) = \{w_3\}$ , and  $(w_3, w_4) \in F(G_{n,k+6})$ . So  $G_{n,k+6} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z-4)(a)$ .

**$G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_1(z)(d)$ :**

$\mathcal{A}$  chooses the edge  $e_{k+2}$  as above. Now we have three cases.

1.  $G_{n,k+2} \in \mathcal{L}_3(z-1)(a)$  with  $z(G_{n,k+2}) = z-1$ ,  $P(G_{n,k+2}) = \{w_1\}$ , and  $t(G_{n,k+2}) = 0$ . This case is identical to  $G_{n,k+2}$  in the first case of  $\mathcal{L}_1(z)(b)$  above and  $\mathcal{A}$  follows the same pattern.
2.  $G_{n,k+2} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z-1)(c)$  with  $z(G_{n,k+2}) = z-1$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+2}) = 0$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+2}) = \{u_1, w_1\}$ , and  $(u_1, w_1) \in F(G_{n,k+2})$ . This case is identical to  $G_{n,k+2}$  in  $\mathcal{L}_1(z)(c)$  above and  $\mathcal{A}$  follows the same pattern.
3.  $G_{n,k+2} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z-1)(c)$  with  $z(G_{n,k+2}) = z-1$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+2}) = 0$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+2}) = \{u_2, w_1\}$ , and  $(u_2, w_1) \in F(G_{n,k+2})$ . This case is identical to  $G_{n,k+2}$  in  $\mathcal{L}_1(z)(c)$  above and  $\mathcal{A}$  follows the same pattern.

□

**Lemma 5.4.** *For  $n \geq 3$ , in  $\Gamma_{\{B3,T,C\}}(n)$ , if either player chooses an edge  $e_k$  that creates a graph  $G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z)$  for some  $z \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ , then that player has a winning strategy.*

*Proof.* Let  $n \geq 3$ . Suppose the edges  $e_1, \dots, e_{k-1}$  have already been chosen. Suppose player  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the  $k$ th edge so that  $G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z)$  with  $z \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ . The strategy described here will work for  $\mathcal{B}$  as well. We proceed by induction.

Base case:  $z=0$ . In each graph in  $\mathcal{L}_2(0)$ , no new edge can be chosen. Since  $\mathcal{A}$  chose the last edge,  $\mathcal{A}$  wins.

Assume for induction that if  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses an edge  $e_k$  that creates a graph  $G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_2(4m)$  for some  $m \geq 0$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  has a winning strategy. Suppose  $z = 4(m+1)$ . Let  $w_1, w_2, w_3, w_4 \in Z(G_{n,k})$ .

**$G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z)(a)$ :**

Let  $P(G_{n,k}) = \{u_1\}$  and  $T(G_{n,k}) = \{u_2\}$  with  $(u_1, u_2) \in F(G_{n,k})$ . Up to isomorphism,  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(u_1, w_1)$  or  $(u_2, w_1)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. Up to game play equivalence,  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(u_1, w_2)$ . Then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_1, w_3)$ . Now  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(w_2, w_3)$  or  $(w_2, w_4)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. Now  $u_1, u_2, w_1, w_2$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+6}) = z(G_{n,k}) - 4 = 4m$ ,  $P(G_{n,k+6}) = \{w_4\}$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+6}) = \{w_3\}$ , and  $(w_3, w_4) \in F(G_{n,k+6})$ . Thus  $G_{n,k+6} \in \mathcal{L}_2(4m)(a)$  and  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by induction.

**$G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z)(b)$ :**

Let  $T(G_{n,k}) = \{u_1, u_2\}$  with  $(u_1, u_2) \in E_k$ . Note that  $p(G_{n,k}) = 0$ . Up to game play equivalence,  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(u_1, w_1)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(u_2, w_2)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(w_1, w_2)$  or  $(w_1, w_3)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not.  $\mathcal{B}$  again has two choices:  $(w_2, w_4)$  or  $(w_3, w_4)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. Now  $u_1, u_2, w_1, w_2$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+6}) = z(G_{n,k}) - 4 = 4m$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+6}) = 0$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+6}) = \{w_3, w_4\}$ , and  $(w_3, w_4) \in E_{k+6}$ . Thus  $G_{n,k+6} \in \mathcal{L}_2(4m)(b)$  and  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by induction.

**$G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z)(c)$ :**

Let  $T(G_{n,k}) = \{u_1, u_2\}$  with  $(u_1, u_2) \in F(G_{n,k})$ . Note that  $p(G_{n,k}) = 0$ . Up to game play equivalence,  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(u_1, w_1)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(u_2, w_2)$ . Now this case is identical to the above case  $G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_2(z)(b)$  and  $\mathcal{A}$  wins.  $\square$

**Lemma 5.5.** *For  $n \geq 3$ , in  $\Gamma_{\{B3,T,C\}}(n)$ , if either player chooses an edge  $e_k$  that creates a graph  $G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_3(z)$  for some  $z \equiv 0 \pmod{8}$ , then that player has a winning strategy.*

*Proof.* Let  $n \geq 3$ . Suppose the edges  $e_1, \dots, e_{k-1}$  have already been chosen. Suppose player  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the  $k$ th edge so that  $G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_3(z)$  with  $z \equiv 0 \pmod{8}$ . The strategy described here will work for  $\mathcal{B}$  as well. We proceed by induction.

Base case:  $z=0$ . In each graph in  $\mathcal{L}_3(0)$ , no new edge can be chosen. Since  $\mathcal{A}$  chose the last edge,  $\mathcal{A}$  wins.

Assume for induction that if  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses an edge  $e_k$  that creates a graph  $G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_3(8m)$  for some  $m \geq 0$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  has a winning strategy. Suppose  $z = 8(m+1)$ . Let  $w_1, w_2, \dots, w_8 \in Z(G_{n,k})$ .

$G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_3(z)(a)$ :

Let  $P(G_{n,k}) = \{u_1\}$ . Note that  $t(G_{n,k}) = 0$ . Up to isomorphism,  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(u_1, w_1)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(u_1, w_2)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(w_1, w_3)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_2, w_3)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(w_1, w_4)$  or  $(w_3, w_4)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(w_1, w_4)$  then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_3, w_5)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(w_3, w_4)$  then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_1, w_5)$ .

The two resulting graphs are isomorphic, so consider the first case. Now  $\mathcal{B}$  has five choices:  $(w_2, w_4)$ ,  $(w_2, w_6)$ ,  $(w_4, w_5)$ ,  $(w_4, w_6)$ , or  $(w_5, w_6)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(w_2, w_4)$  or  $(w_4, w_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.

$\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(w_5, w_6)$  or  $(w_5, w_7)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not.  $\mathcal{B}$  again has two choices:  $(w_6, w_8)$  or  $(w_7, w_8)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. Now  $u_1, w_1, w_2, \dots, w_6$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+12}) = z(G_{n,k}) - 8 = 8m$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+12}) = 0$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+12}) = \{w_7, w_8\}$ , and  $(w_7, w_8) \in E_{k+12}$ . Thus  $G_{n,k+12} \in \mathcal{L}_2(8m)(b)$  and  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by Lemma 5.4.

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(w_2, w_6)$  or  $(w_4, w_5)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.

If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(w_5, w_6)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_2, w_6)$ .

The two resulting graphs are isomorphic, so consider the first case.  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(w_4, w_6)$ ,  $(w_4, w_7)$ , or  $(w_6, w_7)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(w_4, w_6)$  then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_5, w_7)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(w_4, w_7)$  then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_5, w_6)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(w_6, w_7)$  then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_4, w_6)$ .

In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(8m+1)(b)$  and gameplay is identical, so without loss of generality we may consider the first case.  $\mathcal{B}$  again has three choices:  $(w_6, w_7)$ ,  $(w_6, w_8)$ , or  $(w_7, w_8)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(w_6, w_7)$  then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_7, w_8)$ . Now  $u_1, w_1, w_2, \dots, w_7$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+12}) = z(G_{n,k}) - 8 = 8m$ ,  $P(G_{n,k+12}) = \{w_8\}$ , and  $t(G_{n,k+12}) = 0$ . Thus  $G_{n,k+12} \in \mathcal{L}_3(8m)(a)$  and  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by induction.
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(w_6, w_8)$  or  $(w_7, w_8)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge. Now  $u_1, w_1, w_2, \dots, w_6$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+12}) = z(G_{n,k}) - 8 = 8m$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+12}) = 0$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+12}) = \{w_7, w_8\}$ , and  $(w_7, w_8) \in E_{k+12}$ . Thus  $G_{n,k+12} \in \mathcal{L}_2(8m)(b)$  and  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by Lemma 5.4.

$G_{n,k} \in \mathcal{L}_3(z)(b)$ :

Let  $T(G_{n,k}) = \{u_1, u_2, u_3\}$  with  $(u_1, u_2), (u_1, u_3) \in E_k$ . Note that  $p(G_{n,k}) = 0$  and  $(u_2, u_3) \in F(G_{n,k})$ . Up to game play equivalence,  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(u_1, w_1)$  or  $(u_2, w_1)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(u_1, w_1)$  then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(u_2, w_2)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(u_2, w_1)$  then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(u_1, w_2)$ .

The two resulting graphs are isomorphic, so consider the first case. Now  $\mathcal{B}$  has five choices:  $(u_3, w_2)$ ,  $(u_3, w_3)$ ,  $(w_1, w_2)$ ,  $(w_1, w_3)$ , or  $(w_2, w_3)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(u_3, w_2)$  or  $(w_2, w_3)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(w_1, w_3)$  or  $(w_1, w_4)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not.  $\mathcal{B}$  again has two choices:  $(w_3, w_5)$  or  $(w_4, w_5)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not.  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(w_4, w_6)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_5, w_7)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(w_6, w_7)$  or  $(w_6, w_8)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. Now  $u_1, u_2, u_3, w_1, w_2, \dots, w_6$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+12}) = z(G_{n,k}) - 8 = 8m$ ,  $P(G_{n,k+12}) = \{w_8\}$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+12}) = \{w_7\}$ , and  $(w_7, w_8) \in F(G_{n,k+12})$ . Thus  $G_{n,k+12} \in \mathcal{L}_2(8m)(a)$  and  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by Lemma 5.4.
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(u_3, w_3)$  or  $(w_1, w_2)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.

If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(w_1, w_3)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(u_3, w_3)$ .

In each case, the resulting graph satisfies:

1.  $(z(G), p(G), t(G)) = (8m+4, 1, 2)$ ,
2. if  $P(G) = \{x_1\}$  and  $T(G) = \{x_2, x_3\}$ , then  $(x_2, x_3) \in E(G)$ , and
3. all other pairs are in  $(E(G) \cup F(G))^c$ .

Gameplay is identical in each case, so we may consider the first case.  $\mathcal{B}$  has three choices:  $(w_1, w_3)$ ,  $(w_1, w_4)$ , or  $(w_3, w_4)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(w_1, w_3)$  then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_2, w_4)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(w_1, w_4)$  then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_2, w_3)$ .
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(w_3, w_4)$  then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_1, w_3)$ .

In each case, the resulting graph is in  $\mathcal{L}_1(8m + 4)(b)$  and gameplay is identical, so without loss of generality we may consider the first case.  $\mathcal{B}$  again has three choices:  $(w_3, w_4)$ ,  $(w_3, w_5)$ , or  $(w_4, w_5)$ .

- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses  $(w_3, w_4)$  then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_4, w_5)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(w_5, w_6)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_5, w_7)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(w_6, w_8)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_7, w_8)$ . Now  $u_1, u_2, U_3, w_1, w_2, \dots, w_5$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+12}) = z(G_{n,k}) - 8 = 8m$ ,  $p(G_{n,k+12}) = 0$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+12}) = \{w_6, w_7, w_8\}$ , and  $(w_6, w_8), (w_7, w_8) \in E_{k+12}$ . Thus  $G_{n,k+12} \in \mathcal{L}_3(8m)(b)$  and  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by induction.
- If  $\mathcal{B}$  chooses one of  $(w_3, w_5)$  or  $(w_4, w_5)$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses the other edge.  $\mathcal{B}$  must choose  $(w_4, w_6)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses  $(w_5, w_7)$ .  $\mathcal{B}$  has two choices:  $(w_6, w_7)$  or  $(w_6, w_8)$ .  $\mathcal{A}$  chooses whichever edge  $\mathcal{B}$  did not. Now  $u_1, u_2, U_3, w_1, w_2, \dots, w_6$  are out of play,  $z(G_{n,k+12}) = z(G_{n,k}) - 8 = 8m$ ,  $P(G_{n,k+12}) = \{w_8\}$ ,  $T(G_{n,k+12}) = \{w_7\}$ , and  $(w_7, w_8) \in F(G_{n,k+12})$ . Thus  $G_{n,k+12} \in \mathcal{L}_2(8m)(a)$  and  $\mathcal{A}$  wins by Lemma 5.4.

□

**Theorem 5.6.** For  $n \geq 12$ ,  $f_{\{\mathcal{B}, \mathcal{T}, \mathcal{C}\}}(n) = \mathcal{B} \iff n \equiv 1, 2 \pmod{4}$ .

*Proof.* For small values of  $n$ , an exhaustive case analysis can be carried out by hand calculation.

$n$	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11
$f_{\{\mathcal{B}, \mathcal{T}, \mathcal{C}\}}(n)$	$\mathcal{B}$	$\mathcal{A}$	$\mathcal{B}$	$\mathcal{A}$	$\mathcal{B}$	$\mathcal{A}$	$\mathcal{A}$	$\mathcal{B}$	$\mathcal{B}$

For larger values of  $n$ , we will prove a statement that is equivalent to the theorem: For  $n \geq 12$ ,  $f_{\{\mathcal{B}, \mathcal{T}, \mathcal{C}\}}(n) = \mathcal{B} \iff n \equiv 1, 2, 5, 6 \pmod{8}$ .

**$n \equiv 0 \pmod{8}$ :**

Let  $n = 8m$  for some  $m \geq 2$ . By Lemma 5.1,  $\mathcal{A}$  can choose edges  $e_1, e_3, \dots, e_{21}$  so that  $G_{n,21} \in \mathcal{L}_1(n - 15)$ . Then by Lemma 5.3,  $\mathcal{A}$  can choose the edge  $e_{23}$  so that  $G_{n,23} \in (\mathcal{L}_2(n - 16) \cup \mathcal{L}_3(n - 16))$ . Since  $n - 16 \equiv 0 \pmod{8}$ , by Lemmas 5.4 and 5.5,  $\mathcal{A}$  wins.

**$n \equiv 1 \pmod{8}$ :**

Let  $n = 8m + 1$  for some  $m \geq 2$ . By Lemma 5.2,  $\mathcal{B}$  can choose edges  $e_2, e_4, \dots, e_{18}$  so that  $G_{n,18} \in \mathcal{L}_1(n - 13)$ . Then by Lemma 5.3,  $\mathcal{B}$  can choose the edges  $e_{20}, e_{22}, e_{24}$  so that  $G_{n,24} \in (\mathcal{L}_2(n - 17) \cup \mathcal{L}_3(n - 17))$ . Since  $n - 17 \equiv 0 \pmod{8}$ , by Lemmas 5.4 and 5.5,  $\mathcal{B}$  wins.

**$n \equiv 2 \pmod{8}$ :**

Let  $n = 8m + 2$  for some  $m \geq 1$ . By Lemma 5.2,  $\mathcal{B}$  can choose edges  $e_2, e_4, \dots, e_{12}$  so that  $G_{n,9} \in \mathcal{L}_1(n - 9)$ . Then by Lemma 5.3,  $\mathcal{B}$  can choose the edge  $e_{14}$  so that

$G_{n,14} \in (\mathcal{L}_2(n-10) \cup \mathcal{L}_3(n-10))$ . Since  $n-10 \equiv 0 \pmod{8}$ , by Lemmas 5.4 and 5.5,  $\mathcal{B}$  wins.

**$n \equiv 3 \pmod{8}$ :**

Let  $n = 8m + 3$  for some  $m \geq 2$ . By Lemma 5.1,  $\mathcal{A}$  can choose edges  $e_1, e_3, \dots, e_{21}$  so that  $G_{n,21} \in \mathcal{L}_1(n-15)$ . Then by Lemma 5.3,  $\mathcal{A}$  can choose the edges  $e_{23}, e_{25}, e_{27}$  so that  $G_{n,27} \in (\mathcal{L}_2(n-19) \cup \mathcal{L}_3(n-19))$ . Since  $n-19 \equiv 0 \pmod{8}$ , by Lemmas 5.4 and 5.5,  $\mathcal{A}$  wins.

**$n \equiv 4 \pmod{8}$ :**

Let  $n = 8m + 4$  for some  $m \geq 1$ . By Lemma 5.1,  $\mathcal{A}$  can choose edges  $e_1, e_3, \dots, e_{15}$  so that  $G_{n,15} \in \mathcal{L}_1(n-11)$ . Then by Lemma 5.3,  $\mathcal{A}$  can choose the edge  $e_{17}$  so that  $G_{n,17} \in (\mathcal{L}_2(n-12) \cup \mathcal{L}_3(n-12))$ . Since  $n-12 \equiv 0 \pmod{8}$ , by Lemmas 5.4 and 5.5,  $\mathcal{A}$  wins.

**$n \equiv 5 \pmod{8}$ :**

Let  $n = 8m + 5$  for some  $m \geq 1$ . By Lemma 5.2,  $\mathcal{B}$  can choose edges  $e_2, e_4, \dots, e_{12}$  so that  $G_{n,12} \in \mathcal{L}_1(n-9)$ . Then by Lemma 5.3,  $\mathcal{B}$  can choose the edges  $e_{14}, e_{16}, e_{18}$  so that  $G_{n,18} \in (\mathcal{L}_2(n-13) \cup \mathcal{L}_3(n-13))$ . Since  $n-13 \equiv 0 \pmod{8}$ , by Lemmas 5.4 and 5.5,  $\mathcal{B}$  wins.

**$n \equiv 6 \pmod{8}$ :**

Let  $n = 8m + 6$  for some  $m \geq 1$ . By Lemma 5.2,  $\mathcal{B}$  can choose edges  $e_2, e_4, \dots, e_{18}$  so that  $G_{n,18} \in \mathcal{L}_1(n-13)$ . Then by Lemma 5.3,  $\mathcal{B}$  can choose the edge  $e_{20}$  so that  $G_{n,20} \in (\mathcal{L}_2(n-14) \cup \mathcal{L}_3(n-14))$ . Since  $n-14 \equiv 0 \pmod{8}$ , by Lemmas 5.4 and 5.5,  $\mathcal{B}$  wins.

**$n \equiv 7 \pmod{8}$ :**

Let  $n = 8m + 7$  for some  $m \geq 1$ . By Lemma 5.1,  $\mathcal{A}$  can choose edges  $e_1, e_3, \dots, e_{15}$  so that  $G_{n,15} \in \mathcal{L}_1(n-11)$ . Then by Lemma 5.3,  $\mathcal{A}$  can choose the edges  $e_{17}, e_{19}, e_{21}$  so that  $G_{n,21} \in (\mathcal{L}_2(n-15) \cup \mathcal{L}_3(n-15))$ . Since  $n-15 \equiv 0 \pmod{8}$ , by Lemmas 5.4 and 5.5,  $\mathcal{A}$  wins.  $\square$

## References

- [1] S.C. Cater, F. Harary, and R.W. Robinson, One-color triangle avoidance games, *Congressus Numerantium* 153 (2001), 211-221.
- [2] P. Gordinowicz and P. Pralat, The first player wins the one-colour triangle avoidance game on 16 vertices, *Discussiones Mathematicae Graph Theory*, to appear.
- [3] F. Harary, Achievement and avoidance games for graphs, *Annals of Discrete Mathematics* 13 (1982), 111-119.
- [4] N. Mehta, Graph Games, Ph.D. thesis, Ohio State University, 2010.
- [5] N. Mehta, Á. Seress, Bounded Degree, Triangle Avoidance Graph Games, submitted.
- [6] P. Pralat, A note on the one-colour avoidance game on graphs, *Journal of Combinatorial Mathematics and Combinatorial Computing* 75 (2010), 85-94.
- [7] Á. Seress, On Hajnal's triangle-free game, *Graphs and Combinatorics* 8 (1992), 75-79.